Computer Analysis Verification/Validation

Benjamin Szymanski, PE

"Design First, Then Compute"

"If you are not able to roughly design your structure by hand, you certainly have no business relying on your computer to do so." – Stan Caldwell, P.E. *Structure Magazine*, Jul 2016

Overview

- Model Setup
- Debugging
- Validation Process
- Troubleshooting
- Best Practices

Getting Started - Tips

- Name your model and associated spread based on:
 - Date created
 - Model description
- Create a "save-as" of your model often, specifically when major changes are made.
- Computer memory is cheap, you aren't!
- Easy to go back if needed (i.e. file becomes corrupt)



Getting Started - Tips

- Work from your local (C:\) drive and backup to your network daily at a minimum.
- Faster on local drive.
- Keep a master version including all analysis
 - DL
 - Wind
 - Moving Load
 - Seismic
- Break the model out for more time consuming analysis:
 - Moving load
 - Seismic

Getting Started

- Keep your format as simple as possible
- Get your thought process on paper
- Begin documenting
- Establish a node/member/section property numbering system

COMPATER HEADL	672	man
	Overland by	Date
MODEL THAT NUMBER	N'S SHSTERY:	
	and the constraints	
# #	R H H H	
~	1 Consideration and	
	REW THE	
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	FIER No	
COMPONENT	3E4(E3	
PECK	7000	
FLOOR OF AM	3.000	
BEALING HENDER	40.00	
PIER CAP	50 00	
PIER CULUMN	4000	
FOUTING	1000	
Brazen ar salle	9000	
MIRIN LINK	1000	

- Minimize extraneous joints/members BUT keep in mind what sections will be required for design (i.e. location of M_{max}⁺, M_{max}⁻)
- Use plan drawing or hand sketch to layout typical sections (i.e., typical pier numbering)



- In almost every situation, geometry or loading will change.
- Using a spreadsheet for a base is helpful.
- Different situations warrant different methodology
 - Spreadsheet input
 - DXF file import
 - User interface
- Future proof your work!

	- K			A						- 20	11	- 11
	Fieldeur	vita										
	Avuige 1			10		1.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2.2	Foot	rg1	Fool	ing1	+4p	ing a
INCOME.	F140	status.	Tipetton :	Skew Mgm	The at Deck	Fier Tap Ceressia	Top of the	Pite Cap	Top of the	File Cap	Top of the	File Dip
		122	6.00		1	1. A.	B.	Thebaness	\$ 1	Thirdeness:	80	15.03.040
		287		172	H.	R .			A	. R.	. R.	R. 1
0.09	173	30426.55		1 AU 81	47.94	37.76	26.74	3.00	34,504	2.07	32.58	3.00
0.09	一月	30+42.08	10.24	1	47.52	98.89	12.60	9.00	11.11	3.00		
90.0	1.12	89+48.30	94,18	1.1	- 18.02	142.79	8.87	5.00	547	加井	11.85	8.80
0.09	104	46-19-41	338.89		- 29.75	46.20	8.52	3.03	8.05	5.FF	1.90	18.00
0.09	- 25	87-16.89	312.94		80.85	10.00	0126	3.08	11.68	9.00		
0.00		44-61,77	10.12	41	31,02	44.51	5.58	1.01	5.41	3.00		
0.08	87	45-16.52	47.07.	1.1	11110	100423	3.43	5.09	3.39	5.00		
90.0	19	45480.25	10.54	1.1	81.82	48.25	14.19	5.00	3.65	3.00		
						11200	100		1 812	1	1	
and the local division of the	100	All States	1000	the second	In straight and	Res Training	1001	All Cont	192	No.	Transform 1	114.1
enore s.		20220	382871	· main softer	Distance in the second	11.	D.	Thustress		Trekness	-36 CF 1.00	Thicknes
		ADR	*	Seg	n.	11	n.	÷.		n	*	n.
437	D4-F1	38+40.00	1.1		10,25	-41.10	16.74	1.00	34.504	1.02.0	12.18	3.00
-5,30	84.42	37-48.50	38147		45.40	36.13	12.80	1.08	32.827	5.00	12000	100
-2.36	04-75	35+58.73	99.85		39.41	51.28	\$.51	5.00	8478	5.00	11.85	3.80
-1.68	04-84	30+88.80	300.08	1.000	33,48	50.50	8.51	5,08	8.392	5.00	7.50	5.80
-0.30	54-85	54450.06	217.88		19.12	28.34	11.06	5.00	11.663	5.00		
0.08	64.76	89+83.53	47.84		38.84	26.79	1.56	5.00	4.409	1.00		
0.08	- 84.00	10+61.84	247.002	100	26.64	25.79	1.41	6.22	1.000	1.02		
	The sta	ALC: NO. OF CO.	100.00		- 10.00	100 Mg	14.10	1.00	1.455	6.00	1	

- Thoroughly document loading within spreadsheet or hand calculations.
- Break out each load type so future results can be easily identified. (i.e. barrier load, FWS, counterweight, etc.)

Loads to be ap	plied to the	model:	Type	: p	w	P
			30.6	psf	k/ft	k
	1	Connections	DC1	EGs = 1	20%, FBs	115%
	2	Splices	DC1		1.219	
	3	Stringers	DC1		SEE BELOW	(
	4	Utilities	WØ	5.56		·
	5	Sub stringers	DC1	1.97		
	6	Haunches	DC1	1.34		
	7	Overlay	DW	11.64		
	8	FWS	DW	25.86		
	9	Add'I deck	DC1	4.48		
	10	Barriers	DC2	13.33		
	11	Pedestrian Rail and Fence	DC2	Appl	lied as line	loads
	12	Concrete fill	DC1		SEE TABLE	
	13	Pier Cap	DC1		3.12	
	14	Footings	DC1	1		2278

Bridge Model:

- Spreadsheet created for nodes, members, plates, section properties.
- Spreadsheet name associated with date and model
- Horizontal curves, Vertical profile and superelevations/cross-slopes developed from civil data.
- Simple input, flexible for the possibility of future change (it will happen).

	Secretry into				Geometry	a landra :								
	Wertical Cuive				Vertical C	une .				Planateria	Carve			
MAIN				BAVP						DEFAIN				
				1000					Begin Co	ordinates.				
Tangerit 1	PVC3/#	10+33.70		Tangerit 1	INC Sta	18+68.52	12 - I					1018859.		
	16.	\$3.02	ά.		Ð.	38.66	*			¥.		220591.1		
	PVT Sta	46+60.00			PVT Sta	15+10.63			Targers	Enit STA		\$1+55.02		
	D.	53.62	R		. D.	25.65				Begin STA		49+87.29		
	A.	1646.80	n		4	1512.11	11			angre		324.916 1	N :	
e	#1	0.09%	111		gi	0.00%	1							
General -	PVCSta	16+90.00		Carne I	PVC Sta	33+98.63	1	111			Chier	dial.		
	41	\$1,02	11	1.200	Ð	28.65	*	110.00			CHOP.			
	PVT Sta	47+70.00			PVT Sta	15+78.65		0.00						
	M.	50.82	n .		.0	32.83		12.20						
	4	90.00	n		1	190.00								and a state of the
	gi	0.00%			gl	0.00%		100					and a second	-
-	41	1,15%		a second second	\$2	6,00%		1000				and a state of the		
Tempent 1	PVC.5tel	47+70.00		Tangent 1	TVC Sta	15+78.85		16.00				-		
	B	50.51	n	120-0101010	8	34	1	1.5.						
	PVT ina	10+18.98			PVT Sta	38+80.43		91.00						
	£1.	40.01	n		.肉.	46.0	it.	100						
	L	248.98	n		3L	301.80		1.00						
	gi	-1.199		-	10	6.025		1.690						
Curve 2	/VC3te	30+18.58		Carie 2	PVC 5th	38+60,43		104	10.00 Di+0	101.24400.0	294000	10-0100	1406.00	10-11-12 12-1
	東	47.71	ήr .	101825	-R	46.9	1							
	PVT Sta	11-68.98			7V12m	30+70.45								
	(2)	48.82			Ð	42.54	10							
	3.	130.00	π		3	95.00	h							
	#1	-133%			101	4.00%								
	10	3.62%			42	1.86%								
Tangent Z	PVC Sta	32+66.58		3 brigere I	PVC 5te	19+72.43	1							
	¢I.	48.82	π.		0	49.84	*							
	IPVT Sta	13+10.00			PVT Sta	42+07 48								
	(8).	49.897	n.:		8.	54.25								
	14.)	43.13	n:		1	257.09	*							
		2,626			Cert.	1.600								

Structu	re Weight Cho	eck:				
Superstr	ucture:					
				Factor	W (kips)	
	Girders	1971	kips	1.2	2,365	
	Floorbeams:	2288	kips	1.15	2,631	
	Deck:	11084	kips	1	11,084	
La	teral Bracing:	41.85	kips	1	42	
				Subtotal:	16,122	kips
Substruc	ture;					
Pler 1				Factor	W (kips)	
	Cap:	1804.2	kips	1	1,804	
	Column 1:	375.92	kips	1	376	
	Column 2:	384.41	kips	1	384	
Pier 2				Factor	W (kips)	
	Cap:	1804.2	kips	1	1,804	
	Column 1:	317.02827	kips	1	317	
	Column 2:	335.82477	kips	1	336	
	100000000000000000000000000000000000000			Subtotal:	5,022	kips
			Total Strue	cture Weight:	33,658	kips
			MIDAS Total	SW Reaction:	34,511	kips
				% Diff:	2.54%	

Bridge Model:

- Spreadsheet is linked throughout so that future changes are automatic.
- Consistency will help with a repetitive model.
- Add a check of geometry/loads in parallel of input section.

Bridge Model:

Spreadsheet data may be input using:

.mcb file:

- MCB file or
- Piece by piece using "MCT Command Shell"



Bridge Model:

- Majority of data input using text
- Member orientations and geometry verified in user interface.
- Consistent member orientation is important.



- Even the most carefully set up model can have errors or warnings.
- Error or warning message often further downstream from the problem.
- Errors must be resolved.
- Warnings don't always need to be addressed.

Warning]	Section p	properti	es	(no.308	32) 1	has been upo	late	ed.		
Warning]	Section p	properti	es	(no.309	91) 1	has been upo	late	d.		
[Warning]	Section p	properti	es	(no.309	92) 1	has been upo	late	d.		
[Warning]	Section p	properti	es	(no.211	L01)	has been up	pdat	ed.		
[Warning]	Elements	910176	3	920176	are	overlapped	at	the	same	location.
[Warning]	Elements	910676	3	920676	are	overlapped	at	the	same	location.
[Warning]	Elements	910474	2	920474	are	overlapped	at	the	same	location.
[Warning]	Elements	920174	3	910174	are	overlapped	at	the	same	location.
[Warning]	Elements	920674	3	910674	are	overlapped	at	the	same	location.
[Warning]	Elements	910476	2	920476	are	overlapped	at	the	same	location.
Your main	tenance pe	eriod ex	pi	res in	427	day(s).				
			-		_			_		
~						,				



Common Sources of Error:

- Boundary Conditions
 - Effects the structure stability
- Members incorrectly defined.
 - Double check spreadsheet, make changes within spreadsheet.
 - Make sure this problem isn't repetitive.
- Changes made directly in .mcb file or MCT Command Shell
- Tapered section groups.

/User Value				
ection ID 1001	2 Genera	Section		-
lame RIGID LINK	Built-Up Se	ction		
				_
	Section	roperties	840	-
$b^{\vee} ^{\vee} d$	Area	1.00000e+004	π^2	- 11
K 7 3 1	Asy	1.00000e+004	π^2	- 11
P f 9 1	Asz	1.00000e+004	π^2	- 11
	IXX	1.00000e+010	π^4	- 11
$(\Delta \Delta \Delta)$	Туу	1.00000e+010	π^4	- E
	IZZ	1.00000e+010	π^4	-111
	Сур	0.0000	π	-111
	Cym	0.0000	π	-111
	Czp	0.0000	π	-111
2 A	Czm	0.0000	ft	_
1 <u>2</u> ⊳ y	Qyb	0.0000	π^2	_
40	Qzb	0.0000	ft^2	_
	Peri:O	0.00000e+000	ft	_
	Peri:l	0.00000e+000	ft	_
	Cent:y	0.0000	π	_
Import SEC Files	Cent:z	0.0000	π	_
	<u>y</u> 1	0.0000	π	
FEM Equation	Co	nsider Shear Deforma	ition.	
		nsider Warping Effect	(7th DOF)	
ffset : Center-Center				
Change Offset				

Common Sources of Error:

- Rigid links too stiff.
 - User defined Rigid links should have stiffness 10³ times as the stiffest member it is connected to.
- Rigid links too soft.
 - May not be flagged as an error by the program.

ojuser value				
Section ID 1001	? General	Section		-
Name RIGID LINK		- 12		
	. Mana Buit-Op Se	cuon		
	Section F	Properties		•
	Area	1.00000e+004	ft^2	
P 👝 🤇 I	Asy	1.00000e+004	ft^2	
	Asz	1.00000e+004	ft^2	
– ⊢ – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – –	Ixx	1.00000e+010	ft^4	
לת ה ל	lyy	1.00000e+010	ft^4	
	Izz	1.00000e+010	ft^4	=
	Сур	0.0000	ft	
	Cym	0.0000	ft	
	Czp	0.0000	ft	
z	Czm	0.0000	ft	
12	Qyb	0.0000	ft^2	
4 3 [•] ^y	Qzb	0.0000	ft^2	1
	Peri:O	0.00000e+000	ft	
	Peri:I	0.00000e+000	ft	1
	Cent:y	0.0000	ft	1
	Cent:z	0.0000	ft	
Import SEC Files	y1	0.0000	ft	-
FEM		nsider Shear Deforma	tion	
		naider Sriedi Delofilla		
		nsider warping Erreci	(/urbor)	
Offset : Center-Center				
Change Offset				

Rigid Links:

- Beyond runtime errors, improperly defined rigid links may cause incorrect results.
- Rigid links must be calibrated. (iterative)

Validation Process

- You should have an idea of how you expect your model to behave.
- Computer model is a tool, not the end-all, be-all.
- Are you results making sense?
- Garbage-in, Garbage-out



Dead Loads:

- After basic model setup and dead loads have been added.
- Hand calculate (or in Excel):
 - Reactions
 - Overall model weight
- Compare to model results.
- May also add temporary test loads to simply verify that load path is as expected and 100% of the loads are accounted for.

-	And the state of the state				Provide Co. G.
Press 771	IEL DEAL CRAD. C	PPCR.	Cristelle -	11.1	0.000
					0.00
	DIRHETHRE W	EMARTS			
	PIER 11				
		1	4	. Sints	a 0*
			1	n=	19.00 157.
				LENGTE	50
	WEIN# 14 # = <u>428</u>	i she i	134 KLF		
	PILAMPE	(H)	10 [7]	7 08P EL FT1 EL H	- 25.8' + 3.5' = 2+.0'
		~		I.(1)" -	19.6 197
	WEILST + CLA	Haran)	20 . 118	+ + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + +	
	+ V) I	E.		ID MED	
Piet 1	TITAL WE MAN 7:	72.0			
1122	-	+ 117 534 K	677 .	u miter i	1
			2 Mg. 1	in the part	

Dead Loads:

- Check magnitudes and directions of forces and reactions are as expected.
 - Forces are applied are vertical, are the reactions?
 - Are forces following the expect load path from the applied load.



Dead Loads:

Deflected shape

- Is the model superstructure/substructure deflecting as expected?
- Are the magnitudes reasonable?
- Look at the deflected shape for each of the broken out load types and compare.
- Deflections may be plotted in Excel to compare magnitudes from each contributing load

TRUCTURE OF THE STATE OF THE ST
--

Live loads:

- Applied loading and moving load cases should be documented externally.
- Look at each case using:
 - Moving load tracer
 - Influence Surface/Lines
- Check key locations:
 - Max reaction at a pier
 - Girder M_{max}⁻
 - Girder M_{max}+
 - Etc.



Live loads:

Spot check using hand calculations.

- AISC Manual of Steel Construction continuous beam tables
- AISC Moments, Shears and Reactions for Continuous Highway Bridges

					T	ABLE	2.1									N Sł RI ₹				ITS and NS
		Her. 64	39	Co AJ	al fire second t	- 1931 Constr HS29-4 	t of iter it badie	eer be	on.	. fairp				N-1	l					
	feter.	84					Aug P.			Court	to be a first of the second									
14		***		14 A.A.	****	10		510	1	-	-			r						
14	11	44.4 (41.1)	***	10 AA 10 AA -10 A	1 11 1	54 10.1	44 -161.2	5¥	1	-	H	n #10	•	r 31.1						
1		47.8 47.8 41.1 41.2	418 10.2 10.4	89 17 44 17 4 17 4 17 4 17 4 17 4 17 4 17	4 88 47 31.5 31.5 31.5	100 100 100 100 100	-141.2 -141.2 -120.1	101.1 (101.1 (101.4	1	-	H .300 .300	P	4 10.3 10.4	1 34.1 37.1					6	B
14	1 = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = =	47 8 47 8 41 1 41 8 51 8	418 10.2 10.2 10.2	89 17 4 4 17 4 10 5 10 5 10 5 10 5 10 5 10 5 10 5 10 5	5. 80 87 31. 1 31. 1 311	100 A	44 -181.2 -220.1 -201.1 -201.0	101.1 101.1 101.4 104.4	+ 300 300 300 300	-	11 300 301 301 301	P #0	4 19.3 19.4 19.4	F 34.1 77.1 35.9 37.3	L				(۲
25 H = 2 H = 2		47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 51.4 51.4 51.4 51.5	418 82.2 99.6 66.3 61.3 68.3	89 148 148 148 148 148 148 148 148 148 148	5 00 07 07 01 01 01 01 01 01 01 01 01 01 01 01 01	100 A	44 -181.2 -229.1 -259.1 -259.1 -259.4	100.0 000.0 000.0 000.0 000.0	1 300 300 300 300 300	-	100 100 100 100 100 100	8 40 30 30 30	* 19.3 19.8 19.8 19.8	7 74.1 77.1 20.9 20.1					(۲
1 × × × × × ×	11	89 97.9 97.9 97.9 97.9 97.9 97.9 97.9 97	414 10.1 10.1 10.1 10.1 10.1	200 A	5 H of 31 1 1 31 1 31 1 31 1 31 1 31 1 31 1 3	9 43 97 1 271 3 271 3 27	44 -181.2 -181.3 -181.4 -181.4 -181.4 -181.4	101.1 (01.1 (01.1 (01.1 (01.1) (01.1) (01.1)	1 300 300 340 340 340	-	11 (11)	P 400	8 19.3 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.8	¥ 24.3 27.3 26.9 26.9 0.1 47.4	AMER	CAN BEST	unior	STEEL CO	CHETRU	()
25 H = 2 A = 4 A = 4		89 91 1 91 1 91 4 91 4 91 4 91 4 91 4 91	414 80.1 60.3 61.3 61.3 61.4 70.5	50 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51 51		101.1 201.2 201.2 201.2 201.2 201.2 201.2 201.2	414 -180.2 -200.1 -404.0 -180.4 -180.4 -180.4 -100.4	100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0	1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		1000 3000 3000 3000 3000 3000 3000 3000	P 400	8 19.3 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.8	17 (34.3 (37.3 (37.3) (37.4) (ANCE	CAN RET!	UTLOF	STEEL CO	онетвы	()
		41 4 41 5 41 4 41 4 51 4 51 4 51 4 51 4	414 82,2 84,6 84,6 84,6 73,5 76,5	50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 5	**************************************	201.1 201.3 201.3 201.3 201.3 201.3 201.3 201.3 201.3 201.3	44 -(81.2 -(81.2 -(81.4) -(91.	100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0	4 300 300 340 340 341 341 341 341 340		1000 1000 1000 1000 1001 1001 1001 100	PF 4420 3420 3421 4411 4411 4411 4411	8 10.3 13.8 17.5 30.0 22.4 22.5 25.4	17 (4.3) (7.1) (2.4) (2.4) (2.4) (2.4) (2.4) (2.4) (2.4)	AMER	CAN INST	unior	entel co	онатвы	()
		41 41 41 41 41 41 41 41 41 41 41 41 41 4	414 82.5 84.6 84.3 84.3 94.4 74.3 74.3 74.3	1000 1000 1000 1000 1000 1000 1000 100	**************************************	201 1 201 2 201 201 201 2 201 201 201 201 201 201 201 201 201 201	44 -181.2 -181.2 -181.4 -181.4 -181.4 -181.4 -181.4 -181.4 -181.1 -181.1 -181.1 -181.1 -181.1	101.9 101.9 101.9 101.9 101.9 101.9 101.9 101.9 101.9 111.9	1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30	- 二月二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二日二	1000 2000 2000 2000 2000 2000 2000 2000	P 400	8 19.3 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.8 82.8 82.8 82.8 85.8 87.7	7 14.3 17.1 10.9 10.1 10.4 10.4 10.4 10.4	AMER	CAN RET!	un or	entel co	CHETRU	()
		47 4 47 5 49 5 49 5 49 5 49 5 49 5 49 5 49 5 49	414 82,2 94,6 94,3 81,3 94,4 73,3 73,3 73,3 44,3 84,2 47,4	100 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10		5 43 201 1 201 2 201 2 20	44 -(40.2) -(40.2) -(40.4) -(4	6.36 er V 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0	1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		1000 2000 2000 2000 2000 2000 2000 2000	P #0	 8 10.3 10.4 10	17 (4.1 (7) (1) (2) (2) (4) (2) (4) (2) (4) (2) (4) (2) (4) (2) (4) (2) (4) (2) (4) (2) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4) (4	AMER	CAN RET	uni or	entel co	CNSTRUE	()
		80 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	414 10.2 10.6 10.3 10.3 10.3 10.3 10.3 10.3 10.3 10.3	April 1 (1997)	5 10 1 10 1	5 43 201 3 201 3 20	414 -(a), 2 -(a), 2 -(a), 4 -(a), 4 -(a), 4 -(a), 4 -(a), 4 -(a), 4 -(a), 7 -(a), 7 -(10.30 100.0 10	1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		80 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 400 40		8 19 3 19 3 19 8 19 8 19 8 19 8 10 8 10 8 10 9 10 9 10 9	17 (4.3 (7) (3.5 (3.5 (3.5) (3.5 (3.5) (3.5	AMER	CAN HETT	uni or	ture co	OHETRU	()
		89 97.8 97.8 97.8 97.8 97.8 97.8 97.8 97	418 82,3 84,6 84,3 84,3 84,3 75,3 75,3 75,3 44,3 44,4 14,2 47,4 84,2 47,4 84,5	100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100		14 43 211 3 211 3 21	414 -(80.2) -(80.2) -(80.4) -(100.0 10	1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		80 300 300 300 300 300 300 400 400 400 40		8 19 3 19 4 19 4 19 5 19 5 19 5 19 5 19 7 19 7 19 7 19 7 19 7 19 7 19 7 19 7	17 14.3 17.1 24.4 18.4 19.4 10		CAN BETT	uni or	enter co	онетны	() () () () () () () () () () () () () (
			418 82,3 84,4 84,4 84,4 73,3 94,4 73,3 94,3 94,3 94,3 94,3 94,3 94,3 94,3 9	10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 1	5 00 1 10 10 10 1 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 1	10 43 201 5 201 5 20	41 -(81.2 -(81.2 -(81.4) -(81.	100.0 10	1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		80 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 3		8 19.3 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.9 19.9 19.9 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7	17 34.3 37.1 38.9 10.1 27.4 10.1 27.4 10.1 10.4 20.1 10.4 20.1 10.2 10		CAN HET!	unt of	enter co	CHETRU	
			418 102,2 104,6 104,5 10,5 10,5 10,5 10,5 10,5 10,5 10,5 10	100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100	5 H at a star a	5 43 201 5 201 5 20	41 -141.2 -221.4	14.86 erV 180.1 280.4 367.4 488.2 4888.2 488.2 488.2 488.2 488.2 488.2 488.2 488.2 488.2 4	1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		80 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 3		8 19.3 19.9 17.5 17.5 17.5 17.5 17.5 17.5 17.5 17.5	17 34.3 37.1 38.9 10.1 27.4 10.1 27.4 10.4 20.1 10.2 10		CAN INSTIT	runt of	enter co	онатана	
			478 87.2 89.6 81.3 81.3 81.3 81.3 91.4 71.3 71.3 91.5 91.5 91.5 91.5 91.5 91.5 91.5 91.5	1000 000 000 000 000 000 000 000 000 00	5 H at a star a	1000 1 1000 1	41 -101.2 -201.1 -201.2	10.16 of 0 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1	4 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		H 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		8 19.3 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.5 19.5 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7	F (4.1 (1.1) (2.4) (0.1)		CAN BETT	unt or	gran, co	CHETRU	
			478 97.2 98.6 98.3 98.6 98.3 97.3 97.3 97.3 97.3 97.3 97.3 97.3 97	1-10 -40 -40 -40 -40 -40 -40 -40 -40 -40 -40 -40 -40 -40 -40 -40 -41	9 H 9 J 9 J 9 J 9 J 9 J 9 J 9 J 9 J 9 J	1.42 4.11 2.11 3.11	414 - (80, 2) - (10, 2) -	10.16 of 0 101.1 101.1 101.1 101.1 101.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1 100.1	1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		H 300 300 300 300 300 300 401 401 401 401 401 401 401 401 401 4		8 19.3 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.8 19.5 19.5 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7 19.7	F 34.1 37.1 8.4 8.1 8.4 8.4 8.4 8.4 8.4 8.4 8.4 8.4 8.4 8.4	A123	CAN RET!	iuti or	gras, co	CHETRU	0
100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100			479 479 46.5 47.5 47.5 47.5 47.4 47	84 64 64 64 64 64 64 64 64 64 6	9 80 97 97 97 97 97 97 97 97 97 97 97 97 97	1.44 2.01.1 2.01.3 2.01.5 2.0.	++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++++	1000 0 100 0 1000 0 100 000 0	1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		H 300 200 200 200 200 200 200 200 200 200		8 19 3 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4	F 313 013 014 015 014 015 014 015 014 015		CAN HET!	runti or	snus.co	CHETRU	
		Pa 47.5 47.5 47.6 57.6 57.6 57.6 57.6 57.6 57.6 57.6 57.6 57.6 57.6 57.6 57.7 57.6 57.7 </td <td>479 479 46.1 47.3 47.3 47.3 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.5 47</td> <td>By Ball </td> <td>11.1 11.1</td> <td>1 101 1 1 1</td> <td>444 - (40 - 2) - (40 -</td> <td>1000 0 100 0 1000 0 100 000 0</td> <td>1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30</td> <td></td> <td>H H Jacc Jacc</td> <td></td> <td>8 19 3 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4</td> <td>F 313 013 014 015 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 015 014 015 015 015 015 015 015 015 016</td> <th></th> <td>CAN HET</td> <td>ruti of</td> <td>SURF CO</td> <td>Снатаци</td> <td></td>	479 479 46.1 47.3 47.3 47.3 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.4 47.5 47	By Ball	11.1 11.1	1 101 1 1 1	444 - (40 - 2) - (40 -	1000 0 100 0 1000 0 100 000 0	1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		H H Jacc Jacc		8 19 3 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4	F 313 013 014 015 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 014 015 014 015 015 015 015 015 015 015 016		CAN HET	ruti of	SURF CO	Снатаци	
		Image: 100 million Image:	499 40,0 4	800 100 100 100 100 100 100 100	8 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4	1 44 1	444 -141.2 -141.2 -141.2 -141.2 -141.4 -141.	19.96 19.97 1993. 1 1993. 1 1994. 1 1995. 1	1 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 300 30		90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 9		8 19 3 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4 19 4	1 34.3 37.1 36.4 36.		CAN RET	uttor	STEEL CO	Снатяц	



Seismic Loading:

- Look at your mode shapes. (At least first 10)
- Fundamental frequency/period
- Mass Participation
- % Mass Participation
 - > 90% in horizontal directions
 - > 80 % in vertical direction



Seismic Loading:

- Spot check and hand calculations can be done using the Single-Mode Spectral Method.
- Using fundamental period

Dead Load

- Weight does not match hand calculation
 - Verify weight is accounted for in either "self weight" or applied loads
 - Verify <u>material densities</u> (check the "automatic properties" are correct)
- Very large deflections
 - Check that <u>rigid links</u> defined properly.
 - Check <u>member releases</u>

erial Data			
eneral			
Naterial ID 1100		Name	RIGID LINK
lasticity Data			
Type of Design	Defined 🔹	User Define	ed
		Standard	None
		DB	
	User		
	Defined	Concrete	
Type of Material			
 Isotropic 	Orthotropic		Code
		DB	•
Modulus of Elasticity	4.1760e+006	kips/ft^2	
Poisson's Ratio	0.3	ing by re in	
Thermal Coefficient :	6.5000e-006	1/[F]	
Weight Density :	1e-017	kips/ft^3	
Use Mass Density:	0	kips/ft^3/g	
	-		
Modulus of Elasticity :	0.0000e+000	kips/ft^2	
Poisson's Ratio :	0]	
Thermal Coefficient :	0.0000e+000	1/[F]	
Weight Density :	0	kips/ft^3	
Use Mass Density:	0	kips/ft^3/g	
lasticity Data			
Plastic Material Name	NONE		
Haste Material Name	INOINE	•	
hermal Transfer			
Specific Heat :	0	Btu/kips*[F]	
Heat Conduction :	0	Btu/ft*hr*[F]	
amping Ratio :	0.02		
			Cancel

Live Load

Resulting loads/forces are off

- Is multiple presence properly defined?
- Is impact included?
- Are combination of trucks/lanes defined properly?
- Look at moving load tracer

/ehicu					•
	ılar Load Prope	rties			
Vehio	ular Load Name	::			
Vehic	•				
Dyna	mic Load Allowa	ance :	33	%	
	W •		D2∽D3 →		
No	W 	∢ } ∢ D1		0.64	→ kips/ft
No 1	W ↓ ↓ Load(kips)	↓ ↓ ← D1 Spacing(ft)	D2~D3 H	0.64	kips/ft kips
No 1 2	₩ ↓ Load(kips) 8 32	↓ ↓ D1 → ← D1 → ← Spacing(ft) 14 14	D2~D3 W Ps Pm	0.64 0 0	kips/ft kips kips
No 1 2 3	₩ ↓ Load(kips) 8 32 32	↓ ↓ ← D1 ← D1 ← Spacing(ft) 14 14 30) W 4 Ps 4 Pm 0 db//1	0.64 0 0	kips/ft kips kips kips
No 1 2 3	₩ Load(kips) 8 32 32	↓ ↓ D1 Spacing(ft) 14 14 30) W 4 Ps 4 Pm 4 dW1 dD1	0.64 0 0 0	kips/ft kips kips kips ft
No 1 2 3	₩ Load(kips) 8 32 32	↓ ↓ D1 Spacing(ft 14 14 30) W + Ps + Pm dW1 dD1 dW2	0.64 0 0 0 0 0 0	↓ kips/ft kips kips kips/ft ft

Live Load

- Create static load simulating Live Load case, compare to moving load
- Move to key locations to verify expected results by hand calculation



<u>Seismic</u>

Mass Participation is low.

- Increase the number of modes.
- Verify that option to convert self weight to mass is checked.
- Verify "Loads to Mass" function has accounted for all mass.

Structure Type			×					
Structure Type								
③ 3-D 〇 X-Z Plane	e 🔘 Y-Z Plane	🔘 X-Y Plane	Constraint RZ					
Mass Control Parameter								
Lumped Mass								
Consider Off-	Consider Off-diagonal Masses							
Considering R	Considering Rotational Rigid Body Mode for Modal Participation Factor							
Consistent Mass								
Convert Self-weight into Masses								
Onvert to X,	Y, Z 💿 Convert	to X, Y 🤅	Convert to Z					
	22.1.0							
Gravity Acceleration :	32.1/19 ft/s	ec^2						
Initial Temperature :	68 [F]							
Align Top of Beam Section with Center Line (X-Y Plane) for Display								
Align Top of Slab(Plate) Section with Center Line (X-Y Plane) for Display								
		OK	Cancel					

<u>Seismic</u>

Fundamental Period is unreasonably high, check:

- Member connectivity
- Support definitions
- Member releases
- Rigid link or general link stiffness.

Add/Modify Ge	eneral Li	nk Properties				×			
Name	:	Appr to Bearings							
Description									
	vne								
Flement Force									
Deserve Trans.									
Property Type : Spring Inelastic Hinge Properties									
Self Weight									
Total Weig	jht :	0	kips	Total Mass :	0	kips/g			
Lumped W	/eight Ra	itio:		Lumped Mass	Ratio:				
I-end : J-e	end =	0.5 :	0.5	I-end : J-end	= 0.5	: 0.5			
Linear Properties Nonlinear Properties									
DOF Still	mess		Damping			Descention			
₩ Dx 999	999960	kips/ft	0	kips*sec/ft		Properties			
✓ Dy 999	999960	kips/ft	0	kips*sec/ft		Properties			
✓ Dz 999	999960	kips/ft	0	kips*sec/ft	Dz	Properties			
✓ Rx 100	000000	ft*kips/[rad]	0	ft*kips*sec/[rad]	Rx	Properties			
✓ Ry 100	000000	ft*kips/[rad]	0	ft*kips*sec/[rad]	Ry	Properties			
▼ Rz 100	000000	ft*kips/[rad]	0	ft*kips*sec/[rad]	Rz	Properties			
Coupled									
Shear Spring Location									
Shear Spring Location									
Distance Ratio From End I Dy: 0.5 Dz: 0.5									
OK Cancel Apply									
						C OPPI			

Do a "save as" of your model

Break it down piece-by-piece

<u>Simplify</u> in order to pinpoint problem & speed up run time

Back of the envelope hand calculations

Best Practices

Best Practices

1. Documentation

- Before you start your model
- Step-by-step along the way
- Include notes, methodology, model associated with spreadsheet
- Model screenshots with results

2. Backup your work

- Save a version every time a major change is made
- Save as on a routine basis

3. Descriptive naming and methodology

- Date
- Simple description

4. Future proof your work

Easy to modify spreadsheets

Best Practices

5. Expected results

- Understand the problem you are solving.
- Think about what results you expect.
- Look at the big picture

6. Hand check your work

Back-of-the-envelope calculations

7. Validate model after major changes

- Mode shapes
- Fundamental period
- Reactions
- Deformed shapes

Thank You

References

1. AASHTO. 2014. AASHTO LRFD Bridge Design Specifications, 7th Edition, 2015 and 2016 Interim. American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials, Washington, DC.

2. Adams, Scott. "Dilbert." N.p.: n.p., n.d. Print.