Understanding Civic Engagement in the United States:
A Resource Guide for Media Partners

Authors

Rebecca Burgess
American Enterprise Institute

Jeff Coates
National Conference on Citizenship

Louise Dube
iCivics and CivXNow

Michael Hansen
Brookings Institution

Elaine Kamarck
Brookings Institution

India Meissel
National Council for the Social Studies

Karen Murphy
Facing History and Ourselves

Alberto Olivas
Arizona State University

Lawrence Paska
National Council for the Social Studies

Anthony Pennay
Ronald Reagan Presidential Foundation and Institute

Sterling Speirn
National Conference on Citizenship

Rebecca Winthrop
Brookings Institution

Lauren Ziegler
Brookings Institution

Inquiries
For further information or other inquiries, please contact: CUE@brookings.edu.

Table of Contents

OVERVIEW TO CIVIC ENGAGEMENT

American participation in civic life has declined over the last half century.[1] Today, only 26 percent of Americans can name the three branches of government, less than one in four Americans say they trust the federal government, and 100 million eligible voters did not vote in the 2016 presidential election.[2] In its rigorous tracking of civic engagement in America, the National Conference of Citizenship, which was chartered by Congress in 1953 to advance civic involvement, underscores that these startling figures do not represent a recent phenomenon, but underly a worrying trend.

Civic engagement is a broad concept not confined to high school civics classes or voting in elections. Civic engagement, essential for a healthy and inclusive democracy, is a nonpartisan concept. It spans all ages and segments of society and is an integral part of American life. We define civic engagement as involving three components:

1. *civic literacy,* or knowledge about how democracy works;
2. *civic trust* in the core institutions of democracy; and
3. *civic participation*, such as voting and involvement in one's community.

This resource guide provides information on why civic engagement in the United States has declined and offers examples of where civic engagement is working well. This guide is meant to be used as a resource for media organizations, particularly those involved with the Purple Project for Democracy, seeking to cover stories of civic engagement across the U.S.

WHY HAS CIVIC ENGAGEMENT DECLINED?

We argue that civic engagement has declined primarily due to the quality of civic information and how it is communicated between governments and individuals. We capture this communication breakdown across three categories: self, neighbors and community, and government.

Self

Individual Americans' civic literacy is lacking. A telling example can be found in the Intercollegiate Studies Institute civics test, which measures knowledge of America's founding principles and texts, core history, and institutions. Of the 2,508 adults of various ages, income levels, and political preferences that took the test, only 29 percent passed.[3] In addition, a Newsweek study found that only 30 percent of Americans can name the Constitution as the supreme law of the land.[4] *Civic literacy matters because higher civic literacy correlates with important outcomes like voting and other forms of political engagement.*

> ***Breakdown in Civic Literacy:*** One of our contributors informally polled her high school classmates: Only half could identify one branch of government and many others confessed not to have a view on civic engagement, with one student responding, "What's that?"

In addition to knowledge about one's government, media literacy is important for citizens to engage in the democratic process. Media literacy is defined as the ability to access, analyze, evaluate, and participate in various forms of communication.[5] A 2016 study by researchers at Stanford University found that more than 80 percent of middle school students surveyed were unable to distinguish between advertisements and real news stories.[6] In an age of increasing fake news, this finding is particularly worrisome. Media literacy rates may be correlated with an overall decline in readership of the news: the National Conference on Citizenship (NCoC) reports that from 1970 to 2012, the percentage of Americans that read a daily newspaper declined sharply from 70 percent to 28 percent—owing in part to a decline in local news outlets.[7]

Historical knowledge and media literacy are necessary competencies for civic engagement but insufficient. Trust in institutions and participation in society also matter. As we show below, these communication breakdowns extend into community and government.

Neighbors & Community

In the past, it would not be uncommon to invite neighbors over for dinner or lend a helping hand when they needed something, such as a cup of sugar or a set of tools. While this may still be true for many Americans today, on average Americans are spending less time interacting with their neighbors. In 2016, 43 percent of Americans reported spending time with a neighbor, down from 60 percent in 1972.[8] *Working collaboratively with your neighbors to fix a problem is not only a nice thing to do but also correlates with increased civic engagement behaviors, including voting.*

One of the main reasons for this decline is a breakdown in personal connection. Social media has changed the way we communicate and has very different rules than in-person interactions. Social media users intentionally curate their networks often reaching the like-minded living beyond immediate community borders, which can lead to less interest in local issues. On the other hand, in-person engagement typically provides a wider variety of interactions across age, race, and politics and are typically grounded in a specific place. Beyond the breakdown in personal connection due to social media, more Americans are now living alone — 28 percent in 2016, up from 14 percent in 1960.[9]

The people we socialize with are important beyond just the quality and scope of our conversations. A recently updated inquiry into how people learn from the National Academy of Education shows our cultural and social groups also influence how we experience the world and learn how to navigate it.[10] Social groups influence perceptions of authority and ideological perspectives and contribute to the increasingly partisan fragmentation of news sources.[11] Thus, individual civic and media literacy (e.g., recognizing what constitutes civic engagement, or spotting fake news) are likely shaped in a recursive relationship with the society and culture to which an individual belongs.

> ***Try Talking to Your Neighbors?*** One example of losing the habit of working with your neighbors to solve problems comes from a community in Arizona. Alberto Reyes of Arizona State University recounts that in one neighborhood, many people were disturbed by the existence of large groups of feral cats that gathered because some neighbors regularly fed the cats. Those neighbors that were bothered by the cats sought to address the problem not by first talking to their fellow cat-feeding neighbors to express concern but instead by lobbying local officials to stop the practice then a social media campaign to express their outrage. However, nothing changed until the neighbors who did not like having the cats around finally went to speak with the neighbors who were putting out cat food. They discovered that in most instances, the neighbors feeding the cats were isolated elderly adults with little to no social interaction aside from the cats. Once engaged directly, the cat feeders were generally open to work with the affected neighbors to find mutually agreeable solutions. This type of dialogue and discussion within communities helps build the types of habits needed to sustain active civic engagement.

According to data from the Current Population Survey (CPS), analyzed by NCoC, there is a relationship between voting turnout and multiple civic engagement activities. For example, the District of Columbia was ranked first in voting turnout (74.3 percent) in the 2016 presidential election. Additionally, the District of Columbia also had higher rates of discussing politics with family and friends (63.2 percent) and working collaboratively with neighbors to fix a problem (31.3 percent).[12] This trend of higher voter turnout being correlated with higher civic engagement behaviors – from helping your neighbors to volunteering to being part of a local association – can be seen in other U.S. states, as well.

On average, Americans are participating less in community activities than in the past. Fifty years ago, more than half of Americans were likely to be members of a religious congregation, a labor union, or both. Today that number has declined to 34 percent.[13] In addition, volunteer rates have declined over the last decade.[14] With less community interaction, especially with people from different backgrounds and perspectives, Americans may not develop skills such as negotiation, empathy, and resilience needed to meaningfully connect with others. As a result, we have become increasingly polarized, less open to different opinions, and less civically-minded.

Government
The final breakdown in communication occurs between Americans and their government. This breakdown is bidirectional, including not only how citizens respond to government, but government's ability to respond to its citizens.

Americans may engage less with their government due to lack of trust and understanding of the services it provides and how it works. Government is complex, with multiple layers and branches, and Americans do not always understand how to navigate them. Americans' sense of political efficacy, or their belief that they can influence government, has dropped from an average score of 61 in 2002 to 35 in 2016 on the American National Election Studies' political efficacy index .[15] In addition, Americans report low levels of confidence in government, with a Gallup poll showing that just 11 percent of American report either a great deal or quite a lot of confidence in Congress.[16]

Government officials generally do desire public input and engagement, however the mechanisms they use for doing so are often left wanting. Local town halls tend to be held during business hours, preventing broader segments of society from voicing their opinions. As a result of these kinds of passive public engagement strategies, government tends to prioritize the desires of the "usual suspects" in public input processes — generally those that are older, retired, more educated, more affluent, and less ethnically diverse than the broader community. The concerns, priorities, and interests of the "missing voices" in public engagement processes — the working poor, less educated, younger constituents, etc. — are frequently not heard, resulting in governmental planning and decision-making largely uninformed by input from major segments of the community. The types of civic engagement models that government often employ are often passive, including for example scheduling a meeting and seeing who comes. A better approach, as highlighted in additional detail below, is to use intentional and strategic engagement models such as determining who needs to be part of a conversation and designing approaches, including such things as creative partnerships with community groups, for engaging the intended audience.

> ***A Strength to Build Upon***: Americans display high rates of political efficacy compared to other countries, even when considering the declining rates of political efficacy today. Most Americans feel they can call up City Hall to note, for example, a pothole needs filling or a side street needs plowing after a snowstorm, and have the confidence it will get addressed. This is a real strength Americans possess and should not be lost.

WHAT VEHICLES EXIST TO PROMOTE GREATER CIVIC KNOWLEDGE AND ENGAGEMENT?

Despite the alarming statistics highlighted throughout this guide, numerous vehicles can help expand civic education and engagement in schools and in communities. Apart from individual steps one can take, such as subscribing to a local newspaper or increasing one's engagement with neighbors, these vehicles provide ways to increase civic education and engagement on a broader scale.

Schools

Schools are a primary vehicle for teaching civic engagement, though they are not the only vehicle. Education institutions spanning all levels — preschool through college — are natural places to promote the values of citizenship among learners. In fact, public schools in America were founded primarily on a civic mission. They were seen as necessary to assimilate groups of immigrants from disparate countries and religious traditions to find a larger shared American identity and to prepare them to participate in a democracy. A prominent critique of public schools today is that the emphasis on international competitiveness and accountability in recent decades has prioritized the economic and the individual value of education over the social value.[17] As a result, school time for social studies at the elementary level has declined in recent decades.[18] A key driver for increasing quality civic education in schools is for Americans to more strongly value civic engagement writ large, according to CivXNow's K-12 Civics Education System Map, which surveyed 7,200 participants.[19]

Schools have a role to play in helping build civic knowledge and engagement by teaching personal civic awareness and promoting engagement with one's community and government. We know from NCoC data that effective civic education increases students' likelihood of voting and volunteering, as well as their ability to communicate with others, including elected representatives.[20] In-school interventions like voter registration have also shown increases in voter turnout.[21]

A number of scholars and civics education groups have developed a shared plan on how civics could be better taught to secondary students, including through discussions of media literacy, debates on current events, and lessons on the democratic process.[22] A 2018 report by the Brown Center on Education Policy at Brookings inventoried state civics requirements and found notable variation in the number of required courses and the use of recommended practices across states. [23] In addition, some states have begun comprehensive state initiatives to promote civic education. In Illinois, Florida, and Massachusetts, states require a commitment to civics education in middle and high school along with professional development for educators.

Teacher capacity in schools may also be a barrier: The Brown Center report found social studies teachers had some of the highest levels of school responsibilities and course assignments outside their field of study, including coaching sports teams, that detracted from their ability to focus on their core area of social students and civic education teaching.[24]

There is a growing consensus that we need to do more to improve civic education and stimulate more innovation in the subject. For example, civic education models that do not address advocacy skills and do not explain political processes can leave students feeling *less* able to effect change or exert influence in their communities. Schools can approach civic engagement as an act of service and volunteerism and a development of political and advocacy knowledge and skills in non-partisan ways. This approach cultivates civic discourse and a shared understanding of how political engagement, advocacy, service, and volunteerism work both individually and jointly as effective ways to solve problems. In fact, caution is urged in not separating "the political" from "the service". As Derek Barker of the Kettering Foundation describes in the foreward to *The Civic Spectrum*, students may come to the conclusion that "[p]olicy and politics is this thing that's hard to move; it's very easy to get fed up and just turn to something like volunteer work."[25] Barker goes on to state that "reinforced by signals they receive from their institutions,

students may, ironically, see civic engagement as an alternative to politics, and they may come away from their experiences with even less confidence in their capacities as citizens."[26] What is needed, therefore, are more civic education models that emphasize civic knowledge and skills development, inclusive of the skills needed for effective advocacy and political engagement.

Higher Education Institutions and Coalitions

College and university campuses have a unique role in promoting and developing civic engagement among young people. As young people transition into adulthood and develop their own views about politics, campuses become important spaces to learn about the world, develop networks of like-minded individuals, and organize political actions for change. Historically, campuses both in the U.S. and abroad have been hotbeds of activism that have been pivotal for political movements at various points in time (e.g., the anti-Vietnam war movement) and continue to be important gathering places for political actions today (e.g., the Unite the Right protests in Charlottesville).

Currently, ongoing debates about free speech on college campuses and dis-invited prominent conservative speakers have caused many to question whether colleges and universities are outright hostile to non-liberal viewpoints. Relatedly, a consortium of professors, researchers, and administrators called the Heterodox Academy has formed in recent years to promote greater diversity within academic disciplines, on the theory that scholars contributing from a variety of perspectives and backgrounds will make academic scholarship stronger.[27]

Several higher education consortia have taken up the call to reestablish civic education as the original and primary responsibility of educational institutions. These include the American Association of Colleges and Universities' (AACU) recent study and initiative, *A Crucible Moment*; the Democracy Commitment, an association of community colleges focused on civic education; the Institutes of Politics' network of universities convened by Harvard University; and the American Democracy Project, an initiative of the AACU.

Veterans Associations

America's veterans are a vibrant group with a penchant for a lifetime of 'second service.' Empirical research conducted by NCoC in conjunction with Got Your 6, a non-profit organization dedicated to veterans leadership, reveals that veterans strengthen their communities by volunteering, voting, engaging in local governments, helping neighbors, and participating in community organizations.[28] Perhaps not surprisingly, it turns out that they do so at higher rates than their non-veteran counterparts. Over 90 percent of veterans are interested in continuing their public service.[29] Among post-9/11 veterans, the sense of service and civic-mindedness seems particularly strong: In addition to high rates of voting, nearly 40 percent indicated they have considered or are considering running for public office.[30]

This outlook is reflected in the breadth and volume of volunteer organizations and associations founded, run, and joined by veterans—many of which are veteran-specific. These include the traditional Veteran Service Organizations such as The American Legion, the Veterans of Foreign Wars, and the Iraq and Afghanistan Veterans of America and other community service-oriented organizations such as The Mission Continues, Team Rubicon, and the Travis Manion Foundation.

Professions

One often overlooked way that Americans engage civically is through their job choice. They may choose to work as an educator, a journalist, a government employee, or a medical practitioner, for example—all of which contribute to the betterment of society. The American Enterprise Institute's Program on American Citizenship has explored the role of professions in promoting the common good.[31]

As corporations or associations, professions function as collective bodies that represent different traditions, interests, and values within a liberal, democratic order. Professions and professional organizations emerged in the nineteenth century from a variety of traditionally learned occupations— generally those that required substantial theoretical knowledge and training, such as medicine, law, and science. While professions today have expanded beyond the "learned occupations" to include new occupations such as real estate and hairdressing, the "learned occupations" nevertheless still represent a model for a profession, especially in providing certain responsibilities for the public good.

Associations play an attractive and important role in governing modern society: connected individuals can be stronger as compared to lone individuals. The influence of a particular association varies based not only on the size of its membership and its resources, but also on its ethical relationship to the public. A profession having a reputation for wisdom and expertise can have the moral authority to exert a greater degree of influence on society. Professions that have lost their professional ethos or how they serve the larger public good can negatively impact society.

As a type of association or informal institution, professions can play a rigorous role as "little platoons" of democracy, as Alexis de Tocqueville put it. They can be a crucial medium for creating and maintaining a culture of citizenship, largely by reminding "every citizen, and in a thousand ways, that he lives in society" — bringing individuals into a world of common activity and teaching them the habits of heart and mind necessary for self-governing citizens.

Inclusive Local Government

While government often has difficulty communicating with constituents, a positive example of inclusivity can be found in the example of the city of Pittsburgh. In 2014, Pittsburgh worked through neighborhood safety committees spread throughout the city to gather diverse, representative feedback when hiring its chief of police. By prioritizing a participatory process, the city established trust among the community and was able to prioritize known safety issues in the selection of a top official.[32]

There are many organizations dedicated to improving local government's capacity, including through using inclusive and intentional engagement models with citizens. One such example of an organization that promotes inclusive local government is the Davenport Institute for Public Engagement and Civic Leadership in California, which works to promote greater public participation and trust in government, including by training government officials on how to improve public engagement skills.

Community Associations & Faith-Based Organizations

From the time of the nation's founding, faith-based organizations, especially churches, have been important gathering spaces within communities, and their charitable functions often directly benefit the communities in which they are situated. Yet, the status of churches is in decline in America—roughly a quarter of American adults claim no religious affiliation, and nearly a third of millennials claim no religion, suggesting these population numbers will only increase as time goes on.[33] Also, church attendance is becoming an increasingly partisan exercise, thus churches as integrated spaces that foster conversation may be slowly disappearing.[34]

Nevertheless, there is a broad diversity of types of faith-based groups in the U.S. and they continue to be a powerful force for civic engagement by fostering connection as well as pride in and commitment to one's community.

Non-Governmental Organizations

Many nonprofit organizations are dedicated to promoting civic education, democracy, and dialogue, including several organizations authoring this paper, such as Facing History and Ourselves, CivXNow, and the Ronald Reagan Presidential Foundation and Institute. Other notable organizations include Public Agenda, the Kettering Foundation, Democracy Works, the National Civic League, and the National Institute for Civil Discourse. These organizations develop content for use inside and outside of schools. Many museums and presidential libraries also serve as places for civic learning.

For example, Generation Citizen is a nonprofit organization that promotes action civics in American public schools. They have recently launched a new initiative called Beyond the Ballot that emphasizes the many ways for students and citizens to be civically engaged in the democratic process.[35] They argue that most students learn the importance of voting, but often do not see political engagement through other routes (e.g., researching and writing about issues, writing to legislators) as important vehicles to affect political change.

CONCLUSION

The trend of declining civic engagement should be something that all Americans understand and seek to change. Civic engagement is not a partisan issue: Everyone must come together to increase civic engagement in the United States. We define civic engagement as comprising civic literacy, or knowledge about how democracy works; civic trust in the core institutions of democracy; and civic participation, such as voting and involvement in one's community. We highlighted some of the reasons underlying the lack of engagement and suggest that breakdowns in communication among individuals, citizens, and government contribute to civic engagement's decline. Yet, we offer examples of how to promote civic engagement through different vehicles, including schools and associations. In more greatly valuing civic knowledge and participation, we can effect change, and we should look to our strengths and the many vehicles highlighted above to improve civic engagement for the betterment of our democracy.

USEFUL RESOURCES

American Enterprise Institute's Program on American Citizenship
http://www.citizenship-aei.org/

Brown Center on Education Policy at the Brookings Institution's 2018 Report on Civics Education
https://www.brookings.edu/research/2018-brown-center-report-on-american-education-an-inventory-of-state-civics-requirements/

CivXNow's Civic Education System Map
https://www.civxnow.org/systems-map

Congressman Ed Pastor Center for Politics and Public Service at Arizona State University
https://publicservice.asu.edu/pastor

Facing History and Ourselves' Educator Resources
https://www.facinghistory.org/educator-resources

iCivics
https://www.icivics.org/

National Conference on Citizenship
https://ncoc.org/

National Council for the Social Studies
https://www.socialstudies.org

NCSS Position Statements
https://www.socialstudies.org/positions

The Ronald Reagan Presidential Foundation and Institute Curriculum and Resources
https://www.reaganfoundation.org/education/curriculum-and-resources/

ENDNOTES

1 Matthew N. Atwell, John Bridgeland, and Peter Levine. "Civic Deserts: America's Civic Health Challenge." National Conference on Citizenship. 2017. https://www.ncoc.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/2017CHIUpdate-FINAL-small.pdf

2 "Americans' Knowledge of the Branches of Government Is Declining." Annenberg Public Policy Center of the University of Pennsylvania. September 13, 2016. https://www.annenbergpublicpolicycenter.org/americans-knowledge-of-the-branches-of-government-is-declining/;Atwell, Bridgeland, and Levine. "Civic Deserts."; "2016 November General Election Turnout Rates." United States Election Project. September 5, 2018. http://www.electproject.org/2016g

3 "Americans Fail the Test of Civic Literacy." Intercollegiate Studies Institute. http://www.americancivicliteracy.org/2008/major_findings_finding1.html

4 "Take the Quiz: What We Don't Know." Newsweek. March 20, 2011. https://www.newsweek.com/take-quiz-what-we-dont-know-66047

5 Center for Media Literacy. https://www.medialit.org/media-literacy-definition-and-more.

6 Sam Wineburg et al. "Evaluating Information: The Cornerstone of Civic Online Reasoning." Stanford Digital Repository. 2016. http://purl.stanford.edu/fv751yt5934

7 Atwell, Bridgeland, and Levine. "Civic Deserts."

8 Ibid.

9 Ibid.

10 National Academy of Sciences. How People Learn II: Learners, Contexts, and Cultures. (2017). https://sites.nationalacademies.org/DBASSE/BBCSS/How-People-Learn-2/index.htm

11 Sendhil Mullainathan and Andrei Shleifer, "The Market for News." *American Economic Review* 95, no. 4 (September 2005). https://www.aeaweb.org/articles?id=10.1257/0002828054825619; Matthew A. Baum and Tim Groeling, "New Media and the Polarization of American Political Discourse." *Political Comm*unication, 25, no. 4 (November 2008). https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/10584600802426965

12 NCoC Analysis of 2016 US Census Current Population Survey, Voting Supplement.

13 Peter Levine. "The hollowing out of US democracy." Peter Levine: A Blog for Civic Renewal. January 12, 2017. http://peterlevine.ws/?p=17944

14 "Volunteering in the United States News Release." Bureau of Labor Statistics. February 25, 2016. https://www.bls.gov/news.release/volun.htm

15 "The ANES Guide to Public Opinion and Electoral Behavior." American National Election Studies. https://electionstudies.org/resources/anes-guide/

16 "Confidence in Institutions." Gallup. https://news.gallup.com/poll/1597/confidence-institutions.aspx

17 Johann N. Neem. Democracy's Schools: The Rise of Public Education in America. 2017.

18 Valerie Strauss. "Social studies education facing 'crisis' as class time is slashed, departments closed." Washington Post. March 31, 2015. https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/answer-sheet/wp/2015/03/31/social-studies-education-facing-crisis-as-class-time-is-slashed-departments-closed/?noredirect=on&utm_term=.f327916081d9

19 "CivXNow Civic Education System Map." https://www.civxnow.org/sites/default/files/uploads/system_map.pdf

20 Atwell, Bridgeland, and Levine. "Civic Deserts."

21 See, for example, John B. Holbein and D. Sunshine Hillygus, "Making Young Voters: The Impact of Preregistration on Youth Turnout." *American Journal of Political Scienc*e 61, no. 2 (January 2017) https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/ajps.12177; Jospeh Kahne, David Crown, and Man-Jin Lee. "Different Pedagogy, Different Politics: High School Learning Opportunities and Youth Political Engagement." *Political Psychology* 34, no. 3. (June 2013). https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1467-9221.2012.00936.x

22 Peter Levine and Kei Kawashima-Ginsberg. "The Republic is (Still) at Risk-and Civics is Part of the Solution. (Tufts University, 2017). https://www.civxnow.org/static/media/SummitWhitePaper.fc2a3bb5.pdf

23 Michael Hansen, Elizabeth Mann Levesque, Jon Valant, and Diana Quintero. The 2018 Brown Center Report on American Education. Brookings Institution. (2018). https://www.brookings.edu/research/2018-brown-center-report-on-american-education-understanding-the-social-studies-teacher-workforce/

24 Ibid.

25 Bernie Rowan. *The Civic Spectrum: How Students Become Engaged Citizens.* Kettering Foundation (2011). https://www.kettering.org/catalog/product/civic-spectrum-how-students-become-engaged-citizens

26 Ibid.

27 Heterodox Academy. https://heterodoxacademy.org/

28 Rebecca Burgess. "Second Service: Military Veterans and Public Office." The American Enterprise Institute. November 15, 2016. http://www.aei.org/publication/second-service-military-veterans-and-public-office/

29 Blue Star Families. "Blue Star Families 2014 Military Family Lifestyle Survey-Comprehensive Report." 2014. https://www.scribd.com/document/239928121/Blue-Star-Families-2014-Military-Family-Lifestyle-Survey-Comprehensive-Report

30 Iraq and Afghanistan Veterans of America. 7th Annual IAVA Member Survey. May 2016. https://iava.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/05/IAVA_MemberSurvey_Final_single_pgs.pdf

31 "The Professions and Civic Culture." American Enterprise Institute. April 3, 2013. http://www.citizenship-aei.org/2013/04/professions_and_civic_culture/#.XI_WuvZFyUk

32 "Stories of Success: Pittsburgh, From Analysis to Action." National Council on Citizenship. 2015.

33 Michael Shermer. "The Number of Americans with No Religious Affiliation Is Rising." Scientific American. April 1, 2018. https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/the-number-of-americans-with-no-religious-affiliation-is-rising/?redirect=1

34 Michele F. Margolis. From Politics to the Pews: How Partisanship and the Political Environment Shape Religious Identity. 2018. University of Chicago Press.

35 Generation Citizen: Beyond the Ballot. http://www.gobeyondtheballot.org/about.html